

Message

---

**From:** Bowman, Liz [Bowman.Liz@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** 10/26/2017 2:07:59 PM  
**To:** Dourson, Michael [dourson.michael@epa.gov]; Beck, Nancy [Beck.Nancy@epa.gov]; Lyons, Troy [lyons.troy@epa.gov]; Jackson, Ryan [jackson.ryan@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** FW: Carper's Chart  
**Attachments:** Carper's Chart.docx; Attachment 1.docx

Putting this in the front of inboxes...will use this to debunk

---

**From:** Dourson, Michael (doursoml) [mailto:doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 10, 2017 7:32 PM  
**To:** Lyons, Troy <lyons.troy@epa.gov>; Bowman, Liz <Bowman.Liz@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Sampson, Alison (sampsoam) <sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu>; Abboud, Michael <abboud.michael@epa.gov>; Hewitt, James <hewitt.james@epa.gov>; Palich, Christian <palich.christian@epa.gov>; Ringel, Aaron <ringel.aaron@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Carper's Chart

Liz and Troy

Here is Carper's chart with an additional column labeled "reality." Two basic problems exist with Carper's chart. The first is comparing safe levels developed at different times and ignoring the differences in science. The second is omitting examples where our safe levels were lower than for what the sponsor was hoping.

The chart also has a few straight mistakes. For example, not all of this work was for industry (e.g., PFOA was for West Virginia). Some of this work resulted in lower safe doses for industry (e.g., 1-bromopropare, perchlorate, and acrylamide). Importantly, several of the values were determined by groups of scientists that included government (e.g., 1,4-dioxane, TCE, alachlor degradates, acetochlor degradates).

I would be more than happy to talk you through a few of these examples if this is helpful. Otherwise, I will leave this in your good hands.

Cheers!

Michael

— Risk Science Center (formerly TERA Center) sponsors the International Toxicity Estimates for Risk (ITER) database of risk assessment values on Toxnet: <http://toxnet.nlm.nih.gov/>



---

**From:** Michael Dourson <doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu>  
**Date:** Saturday, October 7, 2017 at 5:37 AM  
**To:** "Lyons, Troy" <lyons.troy@epa.gov>, "Bowman, Liz" <Bowman.Liz@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** "Sampson, Alison (sampsoam)" <sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu>, "Abboud, Michael" <abboud.michael@epa.gov>, "Hewitt, James" <hewitt.james@epa.gov>, "Palich, Christian" <palich.christian@epa.gov>, "Ringel, Aaron" <ringel.aaron@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Re: Pro bono story



Dear Colleagues

I got the chart embedded in one of my questions. So I think I can take it from here.

Cheers!

Michael

-- Keep Calm and *ITERate*! (<http://www.tera.org/peer/ITERReview>)



---

**From:** "Lyons, Troy" <[lyons.troy@epa.gov](mailto:lyons.troy@epa.gov)>  
**Date:** Friday, October 6, 2017 at 10:23 PM  
**To:** "Bowman, Liz" <[Bowman.Liz@epa.gov](mailto:Bowman.Liz@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Michael Dourson <[doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu](mailto:doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu)>, "Sampson, Alison (sampsoam)" <[sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu](mailto:sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu)>, "Abboud, Michael" <[abboud.michael@epa.gov](mailto:abboud.michael@epa.gov)>, "Hewitt, James" <[hewitt.james@epa.gov](mailto:hewitt.james@epa.gov)>, "Palich, Christian" <[palich.christian@epa.gov](mailto:palich.christian@epa.gov)>, "Ringel, Aaron" <[ringel.aaron@epa.gov](mailto:ringel.aaron@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Pro bono story

Of course. Adding Aaron and Christian.

---

**Troy M. Lyons**

Associate Administrator  
Office of Congressional & Intergovernmental Relations  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
[202-309-2490](tel:202-309-2490) (cell)

Sent from my iPhone

On Oct 6, 2017, at 5:07 PM, Bowman, Liz <[Bowman.Liz@epa.gov](mailto:Bowman.Liz@epa.gov)> wrote:

Troy, can one of your folks help here?

---

**From:** Dourson, Michael (doursoml) [<mailto:doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu>]  
**Sent:** Friday, October 6, 2017 3:34 PM  
**To:** Bowman, Liz <[Bowman.Liz@epa.gov](mailto:Bowman.Liz@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Lyons, Troy <[lyons.troy@epa.gov](mailto:lyons.troy@epa.gov)>; Sampson, Alison (sampsoam) <[sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu](mailto:sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu)>; Abboud, Michael <[abboud.michael@epa.gov](mailto:abboud.michael@epa.gov)>; Hewitt, James <[hewitt.james@epa.gov](mailto:hewitt.james@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Pro bono story

Liz



Ok, do you have his latest copy? It very much looked like what Dennison put out in one of his blogs, but I was not able to remember details on the spot. If you do not have access to Carper's table, I will use Dennison's.

Cheers!

Michael

*-- It is the mark of an instructed mind to rest satisfied with the degree of precision which the nature of the subject permits and not to seek an exactness where only an approximation of the truth is possible. Aristotle*

<image002.jpg>

---

**From:** "Bowman, Liz" <[Bowman.Liz@epa.gov](mailto:Liz@epa.gov)>  
**Date:** Friday, October 6, 2017 at 2:48 PM  
**To:** Michael Dourson <[doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu](mailto:doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu)>  
**Cc:** "Lyons, Troy" <[lyons.troy@epa.gov](mailto:lyons.troy@epa.gov)>, "Sampson, Alison (sampsoam)" <[sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu](mailto:sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu)>, "Abboud, Michael" <[abboud.michael@epa.gov](mailto:abboud.michael@epa.gov)>, "Hewitt, James" <[hewitt.james@epa.gov](mailto:hewitt.james@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Pro bono story

Yes, please send us any corrections you have.

---

**From:** Dourson, Michael (doursoml) [<mailto:doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu>]  
**Sent:** Friday, October 6, 2017 2:38 PM  
**To:** Bowman, Liz <[Bowman.Liz@epa.gov](mailto:Liz@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Lyons, Troy <[lyons.troy@epa.gov](mailto:lyons.troy@epa.gov)>; Sampson, Alison (sampsoam) <[sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu](mailto:sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu)>  
**Subject:** Re: Pro bono story

Liz

Senator Carper also had a number of mistakes in his overhead slide of comparison numbers. Please let me know if you want corrections.

Cheers!

Michael...

...L. Dourson, Ph.D., DABT, FATS, FSRA  
Professor  
Risk Science Center (formerly TERA)  
Department of Environmental Health  
University of Cincinnati, College of Medicine  
160 Panzeca Way  
Cincinnati OH 45267-0056

[michael.dourson@uc.edu](mailto:michael.dourson@uc.edu)  
513-558-7949  
419-892-2502 (Mondays)  
<http://eh.uc.edu/tera/>

<image004.jpg>



---

**From:** Michael Dourson <doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu>  
**Date:** Friday, October 6, 2017 at 2:36 PM  
**To:** "Bowman.Liz@epa.gov" <Bowman.Liz@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** "lyons.troy@epa.gov" <lyons.troy@epa.gov>, "Sampson, Alison (sampsoam)" <sampsoam@ucmail.uc.edu>  
**Subject:** FW: Pro bono story

Liz

Paul Dickman of Dickman Law Offices can be contacted for details. The case involved Ms. Angie Boots at 14381 Hissem Road in Kentucky. His number is 859 446 1590 and email is [attorney@fuse.net](mailto:attorney@fuse.net).

Cheers!

Michael

-- Risk Science Center (formerly TERA Center)  
*Integrating assessments for both human and environmental health. See*  
<http://www.tera.org/EcoTERA/index.html>

<image005.jpg>

---

**From:** Corbin Hiar <chiar@eenews.net>  
**Date:** Friday, October 6, 2017 at 11:00 AM  
**To:** "press@epa.gov" <press@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Michael Dourson <doursoml@ucmail.uc.edu>  
**Subject:** Pro bono story

Hi, can someone please provide me with a clip of one of the news stories Professor Dourson was referring to here at this week's confirmation hearing?

"The one [pro bono effort] that was the most fulfilling to me is, we were a public organization, we had members of the public come in. I had a younger mother come into my office one day. She was distraught. No one had been listening to her. She didn't know where to turn. She went to the web, found our site. She relayed her story. Her family had been poisoned. It became obvious to me that the poisoning was likely hydrogen sulfide which is a very serious poison. Her four children were affected, her horses were affected, the dogs were dead. It was really a very severe case. So after a little bit of additional study we were able to get her the medical attention and then the legal support she needed to carry on. **That made the local news several times.** That was very gratifying, although honestly dealing with the public one-on-one like that was not the most direct part of our pro bono."

I looked for stories that matched his description on Google and Nexis and haven't found anything, so I'm guessing it didn't make the newspapers. If the professor didn't keep any of copies of the stories, please let me know which TV or radio stations they ran on. I'm doing some follow up reporting on this anecdote.

Thanks, C

Corbin Hiar



Chemicals Reporter

O: 202 446 0438

M: 718 608 5314

T: @corbinhiar

---

**E&E NEWS**

122 C St NW, 7<sup>th</sup> Fl; Washington, DC, 20001

*The leader in energy and environment news*

Greenwire, E&E Daily, E&E News PM, Climatewire, Energywire